



AN IN VITRO ANTAGONISTIC EFFECT OF *Trichoderma* spp. AGAINST *Fusarium oxysporum* f.sp. *lycopersici*

*¹Suleiman A. S., ²Gambo, M. S. and ¹Sunusi, M.

¹Department of Crop Science, Federal University Dutse, P.M.B. 7156, Jigawa State, Nigeria

²Department of Crop Science, Kano University of Science and Technology Wudil, Nigeria

* Corresponding Author's Email: suleiman.ab@fud.edu.ng

ABSTRACT

The experiment was conducted in the Department of Plant Pathology, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture, Technology and Sciences, Allahabad, India. Diseased tomato stems and roots showing symptoms of *Fusarium* wilt were collected from the Research and Training plots of the Department. The pathogen isolated was identified as *Fusarium oxysporum* f.sp. *lycopersici*. Nine native *Trichoderma* strains were isolated from healthy tomato rhizosphere soils from three different locations of Allahabad; viz Naini, Sangam and Prayagraj. Six isolates were found to be strains of *Trichoderma harzianum* (SP-4, Th-6, Th-3, Th-5, RTM-16 and EPI-5) while the three were of *Trichoderma viride* (SP-1, KI-9, SP-3). They were examined in the laboratory for the control of pathogen *Fusarium oxysporum*. The results revealed that all *Trichoderma* spp. isolates were found to effectively inhibit the mycelial growth of the pathogen compared to control. However, significant differences between the species and strains were found ($P < 0.005$). The isolates SP-1, SP-3 and Th-6 showed significant inhibition of mycelial growth of the pathogen. In this study, while both *Trichoderma* strains had a considerable antagonistic effect on the tested pathogen, SP-3 and SP-1 were respectively found to be more successful having the higher percent inhibition of 97.68% and 92.83% at 7 days after incubation. It shows that the strong repressive effect of *T. viride* isolates (SP-3 and SP-1) can be applied in biological control of *Fusarium oxysporum*.

Keywords: Antagonistic, *Fusarium*, Tomato and *Trichoderma*

INTRODUCTION

Tomato wilt caused by *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici* is one of the prevalent diseases of tomato crop and can cause losses ranging from 30 to 80%, especially in local varieties and under favorable climatic conditions for the pathogen development (Buitrago *et al.*, 2006; FENALCE, 2007). The disease symptoms starts with an ascending chlorosis, followed by plant stunting, in the outside of roots, a brown coloration is seen and in the inner part, a longitudinal lesion of reddish tonality. The fungus elicits a premature death on the host plant which is associated to redness and blockage of vascular bundles (Buitrago *et al.*, 2006; FENALCE, 2007). As *Fusarium* wilt is soil-borne, application of fungicides to control this disease is found to be difficult. Besides, chemicals pose serious health hazards to an applicator as well as to a consumer of the treated material (Hayes and Laws, 1991). In addition to target organism, pesticides induce various hazards to beneficial organisms. Their toxic forms persist in soil and contaminate the whole environment (Hayes and Laws, 1991). Prospects of biological control of soil-borne plant pathogens using most promising biocontrol agent, the genus *Trichoderma* has been described (Morsy *et al.* 2009 ; Sabalpara *et al.* 2009).

Trichoderma is a common saprophytic filamentous fungus which inhibits rhizospheric soil. It acts as a biocontrol agent against various plant pathogens that causes several diseases in mono and dicotyledonous crop plants (Galarza *et al.*, 2015; Singh *et al.*, 2014; Padmaja *et al.*, 2015). *Trichoderma* spp. are equally commercialized as biopesticides, biofertilizers, and soil enhancers. They are nonpathogenic microorganisms that provide protection against fungal diseases caused by *Phytophthora*, *Rhizoctonia*, *Sclerotium*, *Pythium*, and *Fusarium* genera (Peteira *et al.*, 2001) additionally, they promote high yields in crops. These traits are derived from their ability to produce antifungal metabolites, release hydrolytic enzymes, and their mycoparasitic behavior, as well as the production of other substances that enhance plant growth (Suárez-Mesa *et al.*, 2008). Therefore the objectives of the present study were to assess the ability of nine isolates of both *Trichoderma viride* and *Trichoderma harzianum* in suppressing the populations of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici* in tomato under *in vitro* condition and to identify isolates with the highest capacity for pathogen inhibition.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study Area

The experiment was carried out in the Plant Pathology Laboratory, Department of Plant Pathology and Entomology, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture, Allahabad (25°27'N 81°51'E), India. Tomato plant samples were collected from the research and training plots of the department. Soils from Naini, Sangam and Prayagraj regions of Allahabad were used for isolation of the antagonists.

Isolation and Purification of *Fusarium oxysporum*

Infected vascular tissues from stem and root regions of tomato cultivar showing wilt symptoms were collected separately from farmer's field. Tissue bits were surface sterilized with 2 per cent sodium hypochlorite for 5- 10 minutes and subsequently three washings with sterile distilled water. Then, they were placed on potato dextrose agar (PDA) medium separately and incubated at the laboratory conditions at $25 \pm 2^\circ$ C for five days. The fungus was purified separately by transferring the tip of the mycelia into PDA slants and maintained as stock cultures.

Source of *Trichoderma* Species Isolates

T. viride isolates (SP-1, KI-9, SP-3) and *T. harzianum* isolates (SP-4, Th-6, Th-3, Th-5, RTM-16 and EPI-5) were obtained from Microbial Culture Collection of the Department of Plant Pathology and Entomology, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture, Allahabad, India. The isolates were maintained on a potato dextrose agar (PDA) medium and stored at 4° C for further use.

Evaluation of *in vitro* Antagonistic Effect of *Trichoderma* spp. against *F. oxysporum*

Each of the nine strains of *Trichoderma* species was studied with *F. oxysporum* strain in a dual culture assay using sterile PDA as the growth medium. 90 mm Petri plates were used as described by (Altinok 2009). In each plate, a 5mm disc of culture medium

containing mycelium and conidia of *F. oxysporum* was transferred to one side of the Petri plate containing the PDA. Another disc of culture medium containing mycelium and conidia of the *Trichoderma* isolate was transferred to the opposite position of the disc with *F. oxysporum* microstructures. The plates were incubated at $25 \pm 2^\circ$ C and after seven days, the diameter of colonies of the pathogen were measured with the aid of a digital caliper and the antagonism degree was evaluated according to mycoparasitism of *Trichoderma* strains on the pathogen. The mycoparasitism was determined based on the ability of the *Trichoderma* strain to inhibit the growth of the *Fusarium* in each plate (Bell *et al.*, 1982). Similar antagonism test was performed among the three best isolates and Mycelial growth of *F.oxysporum* was measured on the 3rd to 9th days after inoculation (DAI). This dual culture assay was carried out in a completely randomized experimental design and replicated four times.

Statistical Analysis

Data were analyzed using statistical package SPSS version 22.0 and means were separated using DMRT at ($p < 0.05$).

RESULTS

Identification of *Trichoderma* Species

Fungal hyphae of *Trichoderma* species were found to be septate, hyaline and smooth-walled that produces highly branched numerous conidiophores. Normally, the branches were formed at or near 90° with respect to the main branch. Conidia were one-celled, and either ellipsoidal ($3-5 \times 2-4\mu$ m) or globose. They were typically light to dark green or sometimes white to whitish green with typically smooth or rough surfaces. Some strains produced chlamydo spores which play important role in survival. The chlamydo spores are either formed within hyphae or at the hyphal tips (Bisset 1984; 1991).

Table 1: Identification of *Trichoderma* Species

SI. No.	<i>Trichoderma</i> specie	Designation of <i>Trichoderma</i> Isolates	Colony Colour
1	<i>Trichoderma viride</i>	SP-1	Dark green
2	<i>Trichoderma viride</i>	KI-9	Green
3	<i>Trichoderma viride</i>	SP-3	Whitish dark-green
4	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	SP-4	Pale green
5	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	Th-6	Whitish pale-green
6	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	Th-3	Whitish green
7	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	Th-5	White
8	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	RTM-16	Dark green
9	<i>Trichoderma harzianum</i>	EPI-5	Dark green

Evaluation of Antagonistic Activity of Trichoderma Species Isolates

During initial screening of the Trichoderma isolates a variety of reactions were recorded as a result of antagonism. The results revealed that after 7 days of incubation a significant inhibition of Fusarium growth was produced by Trichoderma spp. Contact between Fusarium and Trichoderma isolates occurred but the ability to overgrow and to parasitise the mycelia of the fungus was highly dependent on the antagonistic potential of each Trichoderma isolate and the resistance of the challenged fungus to antagonism (Table 2 & 3). The isolates SP-1, SP-3 (from *Trichoderma viride*) and Th-6 (from *Trichoderma harzianum*)

showed the strongest antagonistic potential with a statistically similar performance ($P < 0.05$). RTM-16 and Th-3, however, had respectively the weakest effect (30.40 and 32.14%).

Mycelia growth of the pathogen was measured using a scale rule in mm while percent inhibition over control was calculated using the equation (Vincent, 1927).

$$PI\% = (C-T)/C \times 100$$

Where,

PI = Per cent inhibition over control

C = Growth of test pathogen with absence of antagonist (mm)

T = Growth of test pathogen with antagonist (mm)(

Hajieghrari, 2008).

Table 2: Antagonistic Effect of Trichoderma spp. on Mycelial Growth of *Fusarium oxysporum* f.sp. *lycopersici*

Trt. No.	Trichoderma Isolates	Mycelial Growth (mm)	Percent Inhibition Over Control
T1	SP-1	17.22 ± 5.21	80.03 ^a
T2	KI-9	45.50 ± 5.51	47.22 ^b
T3	SP-3	27.37 ± 2.10	69.28 ^{ab}
T4	SP-4	37.50 ± 3.30	56.50 ^b
T5	Th-6	24.11 ± 6.13	72.83 ^{ab}
T6	Th-3	58.50	32.14 ^d
T7	Th-5	41.37 ± 4.00	52.01 ^b
T8	RTM-16	60.00 ± 6.12	30.40 ^d
T9	EPI-5	49.99 ± 7.35	42.01 ^c
T10	Control	86.21 ± 4.98	0.00

Values represent mean ± SD of four replicates. Measurements of radial growth were taken 5 days after inoculation. Means within columns followed by the same letter are not significantly different according to Duncan's Multiple Range Test ($P < 0.05$).

Effect of Trichoderma spp. on Fusarium oxysporum Days after Inoculation

The results of dual culture indicated that Trichoderma spp. significantly ($P < 0.05$) inhibited the growth of *F. oxysporum* at varying degrees across duration of incubation (Table 3). The findings revealed that the inhibitory activity averagely started at 72 hours after inoculation. Later, the activity kept rising till reaches maximum, at 144 hours after which diminishes significantly up to 216 hours after inoculation. This shows that all the treatments inhibited the pathogen best from 168 hours

after inoculation, with *T. viride* isolate, SP-3, having the highest percent inhibition (97.68%). This was followed by SP-1 (92.83%) which were found to be statistically similar ($P < 0.05$). Among the promising antagonists, *T. harzianum* isolate (Th-6), performed least with 70.24% as percent inhibition against the fungus.

Table 3: Promising antagonists based on Incubation Period and Inhibition of the Pathogen

Incubation Period	Zone of Inhibition(mm)			Percent Inhibition		
	SP-1	SP-3	Th-6	SP-1	SP-3	Th-6
72 hours	79.10 ± 8.60	84.12 ± 8.10	61.22 ± 8.12	8.25 ^d	2.42 ^c	28.99 ^d
96 hours	62.11 ± 1.22	79.80 ± 11.11	48.00	27.95 ^c	7.44 ^c	44.32 ^c
120 hours	32.10 ± 7.10	29.22 ± 2.22	31.00 ± 2.00	62.77 ^b	66.11 ^b	64.04 ^b
144 hours	14.10 ± 1.61	8.99 ± 3.30	28.18 ± 6.60	83.64 ^{ab}	89.58 ^a	67.31 ^b
168 hours	6.18 ± 0.91	2.00 ± 0.61	25.66 ± 7.11	92.83 ^a	97.68 ^a	70.24 ^a
192 hours	6.00 ± 1.23	2.11 ± 1.10	25.12 ± 6.66	93.04 ^a	97.55 ^a	70.86 ^a
216 hours	6.81 ± 0.99	2.10 ± 0.88	24.99 ± 6.54	92.10 ^a	97.56 ^a	71.01 ^a

Values represent mean ± SD of four replicates. Measurements of radial growth were taken 3 to 9 days after inoculation. Means within columns followed by the same letter are not significantly different according to Duncan's Multiple Range Test ($P < 0.05$).



A: *T. harzianum* (Th-6)
with *F. oxysporum*

B: *T. viride* (SP-1)
with *F. oxysporum*

C: *T. viride* (SP-3)
with *F. oxysporum*

In vitro antagonistic effect of *Trichoderma* spp. isolates on tomato wilt pathogen (*Fusarium oxysporum* f.sp. *lycopersici*) hours after inoculation

DISCUSSION

T. harzianum and *T. viride* isolates used in this work were able to reduced mycelial growth of *F. oxysporum* when grown in dual culture irrespective of the time of introduction of the antagonist. However, it is found that the highest inhibition is observed at seven days after inoculation. The study also showed that among the strains of *Trichoderma* spp. isolates tested against *F. oxysporum* f.sp. *lycopersici*, the strains SP-1, SP-3 and Th-6 showed a significant inhibitory effect on the mycelial growth of pathogen compared to other strains and control. It was found that during parasitism *Trichoderma* spp. showed a target-directed growth towards the mycelia of its hosts and an increased formation of conidiophores, phialides and conidia. Formation of aplanospores-like structures enabled the hyphae of *Trichoderma* spp. to attach firmly to the surface of its host mycelia. Penetration of the mycelia occurred with fine hyphae. The secretion of lytic enzymes and fungicidal substances lead to complete cell wall degradation and efflux of cytoplasm.

This study agreed with the work of Ekefan *et al.* (2009) who showed that *T. harzianum* isolates suppressed the growth of *Colletotrichum capsici* eventually overgrowing it within seven days. It is equally similar with the findings of Azza and Allam (2004) who demonstrated that the *Trichoderma* isolates have a strong antagonism against wilt diseases caused by *Fusarium* sp, *in vitro*, on potato dextrose agar medium, whereby the mycelia growths were decreased by 88%, 86% and 80% by *Trichoderma harzianum*, *T. hamatum* and *T. viride* respectively. Also, our results tally with Hibar *et al.* (2005) who demonstrated that *Trichoderma harzianum* inhibited the growth of pathogenic fungus, *Fusarium oxysporum*, *in vitro*, with a ratio more than 65%. Moreover, the volatile metabolic substances of the antagonist reduced the pathogenic fungus growth by 63% compared with controls. Our work is in harmony with the dual culture experiments of Hacer *et al.* (2015), who studied the *in vitro* effect of *T. harzianum* against *F. oxysporum* with the strains T16 and T23 showing a significant inhibitory effect on the mycelia growth of the pathogen when compared to the

control. *T. harzianum* (T16) grew much faster on PDA than the tested pathogens under the same culture conditions. The maximum inhibition was recorded when the *T. harzianum* strain T16 was used (72.69%). The study concluded that T16 was more efficient than strain T23 in inhibiting colony growth of the pathogen *F. oxysporum* isolates.

Nevertheless, Calistru *et al.* (1997) and Elkhatny *et al.* (2006) discovered that microscopic studies showed no overgrowth, hyphal penetration, or hyphal coiling (hyperparasitism) of *Fusarium* around hyphae of pathogenic *F. oxysporum* strains, suggesting that mycoparasitism was not a major mechanism for the observed inhibitory effects. The pathogen and *Trichoderma* hyphae did not interfere with each other in dual cultures and this was explained by the production of extracellular mycolytic enzymes by *T. harzianum*. They suggested that the extracellular mycolytic enzymes secreted by *Trichoderma* might play an important role in antibiosis against pathogenic *F. oxysporum*. On the other hand, fungitoxic metabolite secretion by *Trichoderma* might not be the primary mechanism in biocontrol, instead it could be through the competition or parasitism of pathogen hyphae (Mukherjee and Raghu, 1997).

CONCLUSION

The *in vitro* study showed that the two species of *Trichoderma* used have antagonistic potential against *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici*, causal organism of tomato wilt. Among the isolates, SP-1 and SP-3 from *Trichoderma viride* and Th-6 from *Trichoderma harzianum* performed significantly better. Following the screening of the promising antagonists, including their effectiveness with duration of incubation to select one effective strain, SP-3 having the highest percent inhibition of the pathogen can be included in the biological control of *Fusarium* wilt disease of tomato. However, positive results obtained from *in vitro* studies are only indicative, as experimental conditions do not take all ecological and endemic factors into account. For this reason field studies are essential to test the selected competitive biocontrol agents under field conditions.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

To Gyang Kumar for enabling the samples collection of symptomatic plants from the farmer's field. To A. Zeeshan for supplying cultures from Microbial Culture Collection used in this study. Finally the laboratory support from Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture is gratefully acknowledged.

REFERENCES

- Buitrago, J., Duarte, C. and Sarmiento, A. (2006). El cultivo de la arveja en Colombia. Federación Nacional de Cultivadores de Cereales y Leguminosas-FENALCE y Fondo Nacional Cerealista. (Eds). *Produmedios. Bogotá, Colombia*. pp.102.
- Hayes, W.J., and Laws, E.R. (1991). Handbook of Pesticide Toxicology. Academic Press, India, Vol.1.
- Morsy, E.M, Abdel-Kawi, K.A and Khalil, M.A (2009). Efficacy of *Trichoderma viride* and *Bacillus subtilis* as biocontrol agents against *Fusarium solani* on tomato plants. *Egyptian journal of Plant Pathology* 37(1): 47-57.
- Sabalpara, A.N, Priya, J., Waghunde, R.R and Pandya J.P (2009). Antagonism of *Trichoderma* against sugarcane wilt pathogen (*Fusarium moniliformae*). *American Eurasian Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences*. 3(4): 637-638.
- Galarza, L., Akagi, Y. Tkao, K., Kim, C.S and Maekawa, N. (2015). Characterization of *Trichoderma* species isolated in Ecuador and their antagonistic activities against phytopathogenic fungi from Ecuador and Japan. *J Gen Plant Pathol* 81: 201-210.
- Singh, A., Srivastava, M., Kumar, V. Sharma, A. and Pandey, S. (2014). Exploration and interaction of *Trichoderma* species and their metabolites by confrontation assay against *Pythium aphanidermatum*. *Int J Sci Res* 3: 44-48.
- Padmaja, M., Swathi, J. Narendra, K. Sowjanya, K. and Jawahar, B.P. (2015). Comparative analysis of different DNA isolation methods. *Int J Pharm Sci* 5: 322-325.
- Peteira, B., Martinez, B., Muñoz, Y. and Miranda, I. (2001). Caracterización molecular de la diversidad genética en algunos aislamientos promisorios de *Trichoderma* spp. *Rev Protec Veg* 16: 157-158.
- Ezziyyani, M., Pérez, C., Sid, A., Requena, M. and Candela, M. (2004). *Trichoderma harzianum* como biofungicida para el biocontrol de *Phytophthora capsici* en plantas de pimiento (*Capsicum annuum* L.). *Anal Biol* 26: 35-45.
- Suárez-Mesa, C.L., Fernández-Barbosa, R.J, Valerio, N.O, GámezCarrillo, R.M. and Páez-Redondo, A.R (2008). *Trichoderma harzianum* in vitro antagonism against *Fusarium solani* (Mart.) Sacc. associated to withering in passion fruit. *Rev Colomb Biotechnol* 10: 35-43
- Altinok, H.H. (2009). In vitro production of fumonisin B1 and B2 by *Fusarium moniliforme* and the biocontrol activity of *Trichoderma harzianum*. *Annals of Microbiology* 59(3):509-516.
- Bell, D.K, Wells, H.D and Markham, C.R (1982). In vitro antagonism of *Trichoderma* species against six fungal plant pathogens. *Phytopathology*, 72(4):379
- Vincent, J.M. (1927) In Vitro Antagonism of isolates of *Trichoderma* spp. against *Sclerotium rolfsii*. *Nature* 159: 850.
- Hajieghrari, B., Torabi-Giglou, M., Mohammadi, M.R. and Davari, M. (2008). Biological potential of some Iranian *Trichoderma* isolates in the control of soil borne plant pathogenic fungi. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 7 (8):967-972.
- Bisset, J. (1984). A revision of the genus *Trichoderma*. *Can J Microbiol* 62: 924-931.
- Bisset, (1991). Exploration and interaction of *Trichoderma* species. *Can Jour Bota* 69: 2373-2417.
- Ekefan, E.J., Jama, A. and Gowen, S.R. (2009). Potential of *Trichoderma harzianum* isolates in bio control of *Colletotrichum capsici* causing anthracnose of pepper (*Capsicum* spp.) in Nigeria. *J Appl Bios* 20:1138-1145.
- Azza, A.T. and Allam, D.A (2004). Improving cumin production under soil infestation with *Fusarium* Pathogen 1. *Bull Environ Res* 2: 35-45.
- Hibar, K., Mejda, D., Haifa, K. and Mohamed, E. (2005). Effect inhibiteur in vitro et in vivo du *Trichoderma harzianum* sur *Fusarium oxysporium* f.sp. *radicis-lycopersici*. *Biotechnol Agron Soc Environ* 9(5): 163-171.
- Hacer, Handan, Altinok and Erdoğan (2015). Determination of the In vitro Effect of *Trichoderma harzianum* on Phytopathogenic Strains of *Fusarium oxysporum*. *Notulae Botanicae Horti Agrobotanici* 43(2):494-500.
- Calistru, C., McLean, M. and Berjak, P. (1997). In vitro studies on the potential for biological control of *Aspergillus flavus* and *Fusarium moniliforme* by *Trichoderma harzianum* species. *Mycopathologia* 137:115-124.
- El-Katatny, M.H., Abdelzaher, H.A. and Shoukamy, M.A. (2006). Antagonistic actions of *Pythiumoligandrum* and

Trichoderma harzianum against phytopathogenic fungi (Fusarium oxysporum and Pythium ultimum var. ultimum). Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection 39(4):289-301.

Mukherjee, P.K and Raghu, K. (1997). Effect of temperature on antagonistic and biocontrol potential of *Trichoderma* sp. on *Sclerotium rolfsii*. Mycopathologia 139:151-155.